

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

**HOUSING RIGHTS INITIATIVE**

**Plaintiff,**

**v.**

**COMPASS, INC., et al.,**

**Defendants.**

**Case No. 21-cv-2221**

**PLAINTIFF'S MARCH 23, 2022 STATUS REPORT**

Pursuant to this Court's March 22, 2022 Order, Plaintiff submits the following status report regarding *Housing Rights Initiative v. Compass, Inc. et al.*, Case No. 21-cv-2221.

Plaintiff filed the original complaint in this matter on March 15, 2021 against eighty-eight (88) Defendants. *See* Dkt. 1. By June 24, 2021, all Defendants had been served with the Complaint in accordance with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 4 or had waived service of the Complaint.

On December 9, 2021, Plaintiff filed an Amended Complaint. *See* Dkt. 271. The Amended Complaint did not add any new defendants, but did not name the eleven (11) defendants that had been dismissed prior to that date.<sup>1</sup> Accordingly, there were seventy-seven (77) defendants named in the Amended Complaint. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5(b)(2)(C), the Amended Complaint was served by first-class mail on all defendants who did not have counsel that had entered an appearance in the litigation.

---

<sup>1</sup> Plaintiff did correct the spelling of the name of Defendant Rosa Mangiafridda, who had been named in the original complaint, but her name was spelled incorrectly. Dkt. 268. Ms. Mangiafridda has since been dismissed from the litigation. Dkt. 376.

The current status of each of the Defendants is described in detail below. Before providing that detail, Plaintiff offers the following summary:

- Plaintiff has resolved its claims with eighteen (18) of the eighty-eight (88) defendants named in the original Complaint, and those eighteen defendants have been dismissed from this action. As described below, the resolution of many of those claims has included agreements by settling defendants to engage in programmatic reforms that ensure that source-of-income discrimination will not occur in the future. Accordingly, there are seventy (70) remaining defendants.
- Twenty-seven (27) of the remaining defendants have missed their deadline to respond to the complaint, and the clerk has entered a certificate of default as to twenty-three (23) of these defendants.
- Two of the remaining defendants still have time to answer or otherwise respond to the Amended Complaint.
- Thirty-one (31) of the remaining defendants have answered the Amended Complaint.
- Nine of the remaining defendants have moved to dismiss the Amended Complaint; these motions are fully briefed.
- Defendant 1380 First Owners Corp. has moved for a more definite statement; this motion is fully briefed.
- Defendant GIM Realty LLC has filed a motion for judgment on the pleadings in addition to filing an answer; this motion is fully briefed.
- Defendant E Realty International Corp. (“E Realty”) has filed an answer to the Amended Complaint and a motion for leave to file a motion to dismiss, plaintiff has responded to this motion but does not know if E Realty plans to reply
- Defendant E Realty has also filed a motion to dismiss all non-appearing defendants, plaintiff has responded to this motion but does not know if E Realty plans to reply.

**I. Dismissed Defendants**

As of the date of this letter, Plaintiff has resolved its claims with the following eighteen (18) of the eighty-eight (88) defendants named in the original Complaint, each of whom has been dismissed from this action through notice of voluntary dismissal or joint motion.

<b>Name of Defendant</b>	<b>Date of Dismissal</b>	<b>Docket Number</b>
Eleben Yau Mei Wong 532 LLC	August 3, 2021	Dkt. 147
COL, LLC	August 18, 2021	Dkt. 158
R New York Real Estate LLC	August 18, 2021	Dkt. 159
Guidance Realty Corp.	September 28, 2021	Dkt. 212
FamGroup	November 3, 2021	Dkt. 224
John O’Kelly Real Estate Inc.	November 5, 2021	Dkt. 227
Lande Realty 2010 LLC	November 5, 2021	Dkt. 228
Cambridge 41-42 Owners Corp.	November 19, 2021	Dkt. 238
1515 Lexington Avenue Associates, LLC	November 24, 2021	Dkt. 259
Peter Chris Meskouris	December 8, 2021	Dkt. 266
Hell’s Kitchen, Inc.	December 8, 2021	Dkt. 267
Bold LLC	January 3, 2022	Dkt. 286
Ring Ding LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 299
Rosa Mangiafridda	January 31, 2022	Dkt. 376
Prospect Owners Corp.	February 8, 2022	Dkt. 397
The Stratford, LLC	February 18, 2022	Dkt. 416
Compass, Inc.	February 18, 2022	Dkt. 417
Jan Reynolds Real Estate	March 22, 2022	Dkt. 519

Many of the Defendants with whom Plaintiff has resolved its claims have entered settlement agreements that include a variety of non-monetary, programmatic terms, including higher commissions to agents who rent to voucher holders, dedicated staff to assist with voucher paperwork, training for individuals making leasing policies or interacting with prospective tenants, commitments to non-discrimination policies that explicitly cover source of income, posting signage regarding acceptance of vouchers in public-facing offices, reserving apartments for tenants with vouchers, commitments to training for individuals making leasing decisions or interacting with potential tenants, inclusion of the statement “housing choice vouchers welcome” on advertisements, and development of internal auditing programs.

## **II. Remaining Defendants**

Seventy (70) defendants remain in this litigation. Of those Defendants, twenty-seven (27) have failed to respond to the Amended Complaint and forty-three (43) are actively participating in the litigation (the “Active Defendants”).

### **A. Defendants Who Have Failed to Respond to the Amended Complaint**

Twenty-seven (27) defendants have failed to answer or otherwise respond to the Amended Complaint. Of those 27 defendants, Plaintiff has obtained a clerk’s certificate of default for the following 23 defendants.

<b>Name of Defendant</b>	<b>Date of Clerk’s Entry of Default</b>	<b>Docket Number Of Clerk’s Entry of Default</b>
Morgan Rose Realty, LLC	March 15, 2022	Dkt. 441
780 Riverside Owner LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt 493
718 Realty Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 494
1369 First Avenue, LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 495
3095 30 LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 496
Alpine Realty	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 497
Best Move Realty	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 498
Best Service Realty Corp.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 499
Brittbran Realty, LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 500
BTG LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 501
Chan & Sze Realty Incorporated	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 502
Charie Properties LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 503
Chelsea 251 LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 504
Columbus NY Real Estate Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 505
East 34th Street, LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 506
Fortune Gardens, Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 507
JM Preston Properties, LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 508
JRL-NYC LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 509
Natural Habitat Realty Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 510
Orchard Plaza LLC	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 511
Rentiko Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 512
Smart Merchants Incorporated	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 513
Winzone Realty Inc.	March 21, 2022	Dkt. 514

The following four defendants have failed to timely answer or otherwise move in response to the Amended Complaint, but Plaintiff has not requested entry of default while Plaintiff continues efforts to resolve its claims:

<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Deadline To Answer or Otherwise Respond to the Complaint</b>
Mayet Realty Corp.	January 14, 2022 (Dkt. 324)
Urban Real Estate Property Group	January 7, 2022 (Dkt. 274)
449 West 56th Associates L.P.	January 7, 2022 (Dkt. 274)
Matthew Gros Werter	January 7, 2022 (Dkt. 274)

**B. Active Defendants**

Of the forty-three (43) active defendants, the following two still have time to respond to the Amended Complaint:

<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Deadline To Answer or Otherwise Respond to the Complaint</b>
308 E. 90th St. LLC	March 28, 2022 (Dkt. 445)
PSJ Holding LLC	April 11, 2022 (Dkt. 482)

**i. Defendants Who Have Answered the Amended Complaint**

Of the forty-three (43) active defendants, the following thirty-one (31) have filed an answer to the Amended Complaint:

	<b>Name of Defendant</b>	<b>Date of Answer</b>	<b>Docket Number of Answer</b>
1	Park Row (1st Ave.) Ltd.	December 27, 2021	Dkt. 278
2	Atias Enterprises Inc.	December 27, 2021	Dkt. 279
3	GIM Realty LLC	January 3, 2022	Dkt. 285
4	E Realty International Corp.	January 5, 2022	Dkt. 289
5	348 East 62nd LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 296
6	Alexander Hidalgo Real Estate, LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 297
7	East 89th Associates, LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 298
8	New Golden Age Realty Inc.	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 304
9	WeGro Realty Co.	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 308
10	Lions Gate New York LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 311

11	Myerowitz/Satz Realty Corp.	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 316
12	65 Bergen LLC	January 6, 2022	Dkt. 322
13	Maz Group NY LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 326
14	Eric Goodman Realty Corp.	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 328
15	Jackson Ht. Roosevelt Development II, LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 334
16	Home By Choice LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 336
17	M Q Realty LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 342
18	Verga Associates LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 343
19	Eva Management LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 346
20	165th St. Realty, LLC	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 347
21	MTY Group, Inc.	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 347
22	165 Hester Corporation	January 7, 2022	Dkt. 349
23	Double A Property Associates – Crestion Arms LLC	January 10, 2022	Dkt. 350 (Amended Answer)
24	Hamilton Heights Associates, LLC	January 13, 2022	Dkt. 357 (Amended Answer)
25	PD Properties LLC	January 21, 2022	Dkt. 370
26	3Location3.Co Realty, LLC	February 4, 2022	Dkt. 390
27	469 Clinton Ave. Realty LLC	February 4, 2022	Dkt. 391
28	Paley Management Corp.	February 18, 2022	Dkt. 419
29	Ray-Hwa Lin	March 6, 2022	Dkt. 434 (Amended Answer)
30	Jane H. Tseng	March 6, 2022	Dkt. 434 (Amended Answer)
31	Chandler Management, LLC	March 7, 2022	Dkt. 435

**ii. Motion For a More Definite Statement**

Of the forty-three (43) active defendants, one (1) defendant has filed a Motion for More Definite Statement. This Motion is fully briefed:

<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Docket Number of Motion</b>	<b>Docket of Memo in Support</b>	<b>Docket Number of Opposition</b>	<b>Docket Number of Reply</b>	<b>Date Fully Briefed</b>
1380 First Owners Co., L.P.	Dkt. 337	Dkt. 339	Dkt. 392	Dkt. 418	2/18/22

### iii. Motions To Dismiss the Amended Complaint

Of the forty-three (43) active defendants, nine defendants have filed motions to dismiss the Amended Complaint that remain pending. These Motions are fully briefed:<sup>2</sup>

<b>Defendant</b>	<b>Docket Number of Motion</b>	<b>Docket of Memo in Support</b>	<b>Docket Number of Opposition</b>	<b>Docket Number of Reply</b>	<b>Date Fully Briefed</b>
Voro LLC	Dkt. 305	Dkt. 365	Dkt. 393	Dkt. 422	2/21/22
Corcoran Group LLC	Dkt. 312	Dkt. 314	Dkt. 393	Dkt. 431	2/28/22
83rd Street Associates LLC	Dkt. 401 (Corrective filing re: Dkt. 318)	Dkt. 402 (Corrective filing re: Dkt. 318)	Dkt. 395	Dkt. 424	2/25/22
Saldo Properties, LLC	Dkt. 323	Dkt. 323-4	Dkt. 394	Dkt. 413	2/18/22
Manhattan Realty Group	Dkt. 329	Dkt. 329-4	Dkt. 393, Dkt. 394	Dkt. 423	2/21/22
931-955 Coney Island Ave. LLC	Dkt. 358	Dkt. 360	Dkt. 393	Dkt. 399	2/14/22
Avenue Real Estate LLC	Dkt. 368		Dkt. 393	Dkt. 432	3/3/22
FirstService Realty NYC, Inc.	Dkt. 371	Dkt. 372	Dkt. 393	Dkt. 421	2/21/22
Tenth Manhattan Corp.	Dkt. 371	Dkt. 372	Dkt. 393	Dkt. 421	2/21/22

### iv. Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings

Of the forty-three (43) active defendants, one defendant has filed a Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings.<sup>3</sup> This motion is fully briefed.

<sup>2</sup> Pursuant to the Court's Order February 2, 2022 order (Dkt. 379), Plaintiff responded to the arguments of several defendants in a consolidated response. *See* Dkt. 393.

<sup>3</sup> GIM Realty, the defendant who filed a motion for judgment on the pleadings, has also filed an answer to the Amended Complaint.

Defendant	Docket Number of Motion	Docket of Memo in Support	Docket Number of Opposition	Docket Number of Reply	Date Fully Briefed
GIM Realty LLC	Dkt. 428	Dkt. 430	Dkt. 433	Dkt. 438	3/9/22

**v. Motion for Leave to File a Motion to Dismiss the Amended Complaint**

On March 18, 2022 Defendant E Realty filed a Motion for Leave to File a Motion to Dismiss. Dkt. 491. On March 23, 2022 Plaintiff responded to the motion (Dkt. 520), but does not know whether E Realty plans to reply.

**vi. Motion to Dismiss Non-Appearing Defendants**

On March 21, 2022 Defendant E Realty filed a Motion to Dismiss Non-Appearing Defendants. Dkt. 515. On March 23, 2022 Plaintiff responded to the motion (Dkt. 521), but does not know whether E Realty plans to reply.

Dated: March 23, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Matthew K. Handley  
 Matthew K. Handley  
 Rachel Nadas, admitted *pro hac vice*  
 Handley Farah & Anderson PLLC  
 Massachusetts Avenue NW – 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
 Washington, DC 20001  
 Phone: (202) 559-2411  
 Email: [mhandley@hfajustice.com](mailto:mhandley@hfajustice.com)

/s/ George F. Farah  
 George F. Farah  
 Handley Farah & Anderson PLLC  
 33 Irving Place  
 New York, NY 10003  
 Phone: (212) 477-8090  
 Email: [gfarah@hfajustice.com](mailto:gfarah@hfajustice.com)



/s/ Robert Desir

Robert Desir

Judith Goldiner

Lilia Toson

Samuel Frizell

Legal Aid Society

199 Water Street

3rd Floor

New York, NY 10038

Phone: (646) 581-7506

Email: [rrdesir@legal-aid.org](mailto:rrdesir@legal-aid.org)

*Counsel for Plaintiff*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the foregoing document was filed on March 23, 2022 using the Court's CM/ECF system, which will serve it on all counsel of record.

Dated: March 23, 2022

/s/ Matthew K. Handley  
Matthew K. Handley